

## Restorative Justice Research

Debra Vey Voda-Hamilton  
Hamilton Law and Mediation

The use of restorative justice in Michael Vick dogfighting case was minimal and not applied in a way that enabled circling or victim/offender discussion. No evidence of ***the actual use*** of the restorative justice process in the Vick case, however there is evidence that the case sparked interest in restorative justice and tangential issues.

Research includes a Hawaiian courts use of restorative justice in an animal nuisance case.

1. Source: sportsconflict.org

Link: <http://sportsconflict.org/resource/case-study-michael-vick-dog-fighting-and-punishment>

Summary: Recaps the circumstances of Vick's arrest in 2007 and reinstatement into the NFL. Includes video interview of Vick talking about his experience. Addresses the issues of "retributive justice" and "restorative justice" in the Vick case. Talks about what must happen in order for justice to be "restored." Gives brief description of restorative justice. Touches on the topic of forgiveness, specifically why it has been so difficult for some people to forgive Vick in spite of his efforts to provide awareness about dogfighting through his work with the Humane Society etc. Concludes with several important questions, which follow.

- Are there acts which are unforgivable?
- To what degree should fans continue to cheer for a player who has committed a crime?
- What must a player do to restore justice with those he/she has offended/hurt/etc.?
- What responsibilities or duties do organizations have to 'give players a second chance?'

2. Source: finkorswim.org (Eliyahu Fink)

Link: <http://finkorswim.com/2010/10/06/michael-vick-bill-simmons-forgiveness-and-restorative-justice/>

Summary: Reviews the reasons for Vick's arrest, his return to the NFL and public reaction. Makes connection to the topic of restorative justice, and the part that apologies and forgiveness play in restorative justice. Gives basic definition of restorative justice. Concludes that an apology is not an essential element of restorative justice.

3. Source: [aldf.org](http://aldf.org) (Animal Legal Defense Fund)

Link: <http://aldf.org/resources/laws-cases/animal-fighting-case-study-michael-vick/>

Summary: Provides comprehensive outline of Vick case from start to finish. Includes details about the dog fighting operation, investigation, charges, pleas sentencing, release, and the outcome for the dogs. Includes links to blogs written by ALDF experts throughout the case.

4. Source: *Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology*

Link: [Off-Court Misbehavior: Sports Leagues and Private Punishment \[article\]](#)  
[Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology](#)  
[Kim, Janine Young;Parlow, Matthew J.](#)  
[99 J. Crim. L. & Criminology 573 \(2008-2009\)](#)

Summary: Explores the ways in which professional sports leagues handle misconduct (including criminal misconduct) perpetrated by athletes. Addresses issues that influence how leagues punish players (**\*Pages 584-585**). Touches on the role of restorative justice (**\*Pages 587-588 and pages 589-590**). Cites NFL Commissioner Roger Goodell's comments when announcing Vick's indefinite suspension from the league (**Page 594**). Addresses influence of public outcry/outrage on Vick's punishment by the NFL (**Page 596**).

5. Source: *Federal Probation*

Link: [Pono Kaulike: A Hawaii Criminal Court Provides Restorative Justice Practices for Healing Relationships \[article\]](#)  
[Federal Probation](#)  
[Walker, Loren;Hayashi, Leslie A.](#)  
[71 Fed. Probation 18 \(2007\)](#)

Summary: Comprehensive article about restorative justice program implemented in a Hawaiian criminal court. Provides thorough definition/explanation of restorative justice (**Page 19**). Provides a history of the program (**Page 21**) and the types of restorative justice meetings offered through the program (**Page 22**). Notes the use of a "restorative dialogue" in the case of a conflict between neighbors over an animal nuisance (barking dogs) (**Pages 22 and 23**).